

Interactive comment on “Validation of water vapour profiles (version 13) retrieved by the IMK/IAA scientific retrieval processor based on full resolution spectra measured by MIPAS on board Envisat” by M. Milz et al.

J.-P. Pommereau (Editor)

pommereau@aerov.jussieu.fr

Received and published: 7 May 2009

As concluded by the three reviewers the paper will certainly deserve publication in AMT after taking their respective points and revisiting the presentation of the many plots, perhaps also of slightly reduced number and possibly colour for some of them, as suggested. But I think the discussion and conclusion would need also some more efforts. Indeed it must be recognised that the performances of all instruments with which MIPAS is compared are not equivalent. Some of the comparisons are obviously more significant than others but since no indication is given on the respective perfor-

C91

mances of the measurements, this is difficult to understand.

I would thus recommend:

- a) to include estimates of precision and accuracy provided by the authors or better by relevant validation studies (and references) in the description of each instrument;
- b) to summarize these in a table at the end of the paper together with MIPAS relative biases and precision estimates
- c) to revisit the discussion and conclusions from these.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., 2, 489, 2009.