

Interactive comment on “Aerosol optical depth retrieval in the Arctic region using MODIS based on prior knowledge” by L. Mei et al.

J. Cermak (Editor)

jan.cermak@rub.de

Received and published: 17 February 2012

Dear authors,

Two comprehensive reviews of your manuscript have now been posted in this interactive discussion. Both referees agree that the topic of Arctic-area aerosol retrievals is of great scientific interest and fits well into the scope of this journal.

However, serious concerns are raised in both reviews. These concern the originality of the research presented (including the methodology) as well as the scientific quality of your study (in particular with regard to the evaluation of your method). Both referees recommend rejection of your manuscript.

Based on these assessments and my own impression, I cannot accept your contribution for publication in AMT. I do acknowledge that there is great promise in aerosol retrievals covering the Arctic region, and I am convinced that with significant further work your contribution can mature into a very valuable scientific contribution. If you choose to pursue this route, I encourage you to carefully consider the numerous comments provided in the detailed reviews.

Yours sincerely,

Jan Cermak

Interactive comment on Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., 4, 7597, 2011.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

