Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., 5, C2198–C2199, 2012

www.atmos-meas-tech-discuss.net/5/C2198/2012/ © Author(s) 2012. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



## **AMTD**

5, C2198-C2199, 2012

Interactive Comment

## Interactive comment on "Using particle filter to track horizontal variations of atmospheric duct structure from radar sea clutter" by X. F. Zhao and S. X. Huang

J. Li (Referee)

lijincai@nudt.edu.cn

Received and published: 16 September 2012

General comments: Making use of the inherent Markovian structure of the split-step Fourier PE solution, the authors adopt particle filter to track horizontal variations of refractivity profile from radar sea clutter. Overall the techniques presented are of interest and should be considered as publication-worthy. Specific comments: 1. The introduction is well written. However, add following references to make it more complete. (Weckwerth et al., 2005, J. Appl. Meteorol.; Park and Fabry, 2011, J. Atmos. Oceanic Technol.) 2. This article focuses on how to solve RFC problem. Particle filter is just a

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

**Discussion Paper** 



solver tool. I suggest the authors reduced the length of PF and just kept main implementation steps. 3. Figure 2 shows the differences of two similar surface-based ducts. What about smaller/larger ducts? Minor Corrections: 1. Page 1, line 26: 'estimates' should be replaced by 'estimations'. 2. Page 2, line 5: 'has been' should be replaced by 'have been'. 3. Page 2, line 7: 'The advantage of RFC is that' should be replaced by 'The advantages of RFC are that'. 4. Page 3, line2: 'Their drawback is that they require' should be replaced by 'The drawback of MCMC is that it requires ... and becomes'. 5. Page 3, line 5: 'show' should be replaced by 'showed'. 6. add a reference for eq. (5). 7. Page 9, line 25: 'using the corresponding synthetic propagation losses at sea level to quantify' should be replaced by 'the corresponding synthetic propagation losses at sea level are used to quantify'. 8. Page 10, line 12: 'structure' should be replaced by 'structures'. 9. Page 11, line 13: 'it required much larger computation' should be replaced by 'it requires much more computation time'. 10. Page 12, 'are also show' should be replaced by 'are also shown' Maybe I have missed some editorial mistakes, please check your paper carefully again.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., 5, 6059, 2012.

## **AMTD**

5, C2198-C2199, 2012

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

