Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., 5, C2498–C2499, 2012
www.atmos-meas-tech-discuss.net/5/C2498/2012/

Atmospheric Measurement Techniques Discussions

Interactive comment on "Novel method for fog monitoring using cellular networks infrastructures" *by* N. David et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 12 October 2012

In the frame of this paper an original method for fog monitoring using microwave links of cellular networks is presented. The method is based on the perturbations to radio signals caused by atmospheric hydrometeors. The method is original and the paper is very well written, while the authors make appropriate reference to the relevant literature. The paper deserves publication in the journal of Atmospheric Measurement Techniques subject to response to the following comments.

Major comment. The method as already stated is novel and original. My major concern is why the authors have selected to test the method and prove its effectiveness based on one single case. In my opinion a new method once presented and explained should be evaluated for a number of cases to show its skill. As stated even by the authors it

would be better to compare the microwave link visibility measurements with the data derived from the transmissometers, that were not available for the case studied. Within a fog event the LWC may vary, the temperature may vary, the concentration of droplets may vary. More cases would provide meaningful statistical evaluation. So if you could find some more cases in order to provide some statistical evaluation of the skill of the proposed method for fog monitoring, this would considerably improve the quality of the paper.

Minor grammatical comments The paper is very well structured and organized. Only two comments are given below: P3,L11: change to “as they are not wide spread, they are costly to implement, ..” p.7, L14: you forgot the year in the reference

---

Interactive comment on Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., 5, 5725, 2012.