

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Synergistic angular and spectral estimation of aerosol properties using CHRIS/PROBA-1 and simulated Sentinel-3 data” by W. H. Davies and P. R. J. North

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 22 June 2014

The paper describes a synergistic approach to retrieve aerosol from simulated Sentinel-3 data. The algorithm is tested using simulated TOA radiance with Lambertian surface, as well as using 4 different scenes of CHRIS/PROBA. After reading this paper twice, I can only make a recommendation of major revision. As it stands now, this paper is unreadable. The style of presentation is eclectic, it contains many disjoint pieces without any unifying explanation. Authors assume that the reader must know the details of different models and be well familiar with different publications. The results are presented through a piece of text that seems to be copied 5 or 6 times with slight variation of numbers (e.g., for r^2 and $rmse$). There is no physical insight into

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



[Interactive
Comment](#)

the results and no clear indication of what this method provides in addition to the current state of the art. I suggest that authors explain their model in detail. For instance, the model of surface reflectance (Eq. 1) is not explained at all. As I understood, it contains at least one unknown parameter for each incidence-view angle ($P(\theta)$) and one unknown parameter for each wavelength ($w(\lambda)$). This means that just this model contains more unknowns than the number of measurements. I may not have understood it correctly, but this is how it is described in the paper. In addition, there are weighting factors for different components of “spectral” model etc. Please, provide an explicit description of all unknowns in the model you are minimizing. Since this is 2014, it would be nice if authors showed the capability of Eqs. (1-2, 14) to model real surface BRDF, or at least some comparison to well known RPV or RTLS BRDF models, which depend just on 3 parameters per wavelength. It is not enough to present the atmospheric correction problem through Eqs. (5-6). The terms $x_a - x_c$ have a direct physical meaning, so please re-write that with relevant notations. Also, using the Lambertian surface model for atmospheric correction (given by Eqs. 5-6), the angular error is introduced which will affect aerosol retrievals but this is not discussed. I never saw a decomposition of spectral surface BRDF into a linear combination of spectral Lambertian and angular components (Eqs. 1, 2 and 14), and I doubt it will work as a generic model. Please, elaborate on that. Also, I would like to see at least some discussion on the limitations of this model, for example of its spectral part which consists of 5 fixed spectra, and which obviously is not generic to work over different land cover types. Finally, the results of processing CHRIS/PROBA data (Figs. 15-16) show no skills in retrieving FMF and SSA, which is not very surprising. However, the abstract and other parts of paper present this method as capable of retrieving the whole suite in addition to AOD. I suggest the authors adjust the text properly.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., 7, 5381, 2014.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)