

Interactive comment on “Binning effects on in-situ raindrop size distribution measurements” by R. Checa-Garcia et al.

F. Tapiador

francisco.tapiador@uclm.es

Received and published: 4 April 2014

I'm the third author of this paper, but I was not aware of this submission to AMT. As I kept telling Dr. Checa since the first draft of this paper back in 2011, the English of this manuscript is not good enough to merit publication and there are science issues that might require further attention. Submitting the paper as it features in AMTD is not only unprofessional and a potential source of embarrassment for UCLM (and NASA), but also a serious violation of AMT procedures as I was not informed of the submission and thus had no chance to approve the final version.

The research shown on this paper was done as a part of Dr. Checa PhD thesis, which was carried out at UCLM under my supervision. A draft substantially similar to the

C388

AMTD submission features in the actual thesis. Therein, appropriation of the results by the Institute for Meteorology and Climate Research (IMK) at Karlsruhe Institute of Technology (KIT) is appalling and hard to justify, since this institution had no participation whatsoever on the research. The explicit backing of the paper by KIT in terms of affiliation and coverage of publication charges speaks poorly of the ethics and the internal screening procedures of the Institute, and may deserve further attention.

The results shown in the paper stem from a large, collaborative set of projects involving many people, a quite expensive disdrometer network and international collaboration over almost a decade within GPM. Dr. Checa incorporated to the team at UCLM about three years ago once the projects were well in progress and the disdrometer network was already up and running. His visit to Ali Tokay's group at NASA was funded by UCLM with an explicit understanding of he performing collaborative work on disdrometer research. His attempt to overstate his own contribution that distillates from the Authors Contribution statement speaks loudly on his views on teamwork, ethics and loyalty, but has little to do with the facts. Among other issues, the paper does not credit other people who played an important role in UCLM work on disdrometers, namely Luis Durán and Prof. Manuel de Castro, who incidentally featured as a co-author in the many drafts of this paper we worked on. The actual driver of this research has to be traced back not to Dr. Checa own ideas but to the projects that made possible purchasing the disdrometer network. Dr. Checa played no role whatsoever on those bids. Moreover, part of the software employed in the calculations are the property of UCLM, not KIT.

Dr. Checa also fails to properly acknowledge the projects supporting his research at UCLM. Following EU regulations, the EU FEDER contribution to project JCCM (code PPII10-0162-5543, PI: Francisco J. Tapiador) has to be explicitly stated. The same applies for the project UNCM08-1E-086 (Disdrometers for NASA-GPM, 2008-2012, PI: Francisco J. Tapiador), which is not even acknowledged.

The paper should be subject to mayor corrections before eventual publication into AMT.

C389

Apart from the science issues raised by the referees, (1) Dr. Checa affiliation must be changed back to UCLM, with a footnote on his current affiliation if desired. (2) The text should also be improved since some sentences are simply not English. (3) The Acknowledgments and the Authors Contributions sections should be reworked to properly credit the work yielding the paper. (4) All the authors of the manuscript should agree on the final version before submission either to AMT or to any other journal.

Francisco J. Tapiador Dean of the Faculty of Environmental Sciences and Biochemistry
University of Castilla-La Mancha (UCLM) Avda. Carlos III s/n E-45071 Toledo Spain

Interactive comment on Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., 7, 2339, 2014.