Atmospheric
Measurement
Techniques
Discussions

Open Access

Interactive comment on "Quality-based generation of weather radar Cartesian products" *by* K. Ośródka and J. Szturc

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 7 January 2015

The authors focus a Cartesian generation of weather radar products based on quality index (QI). After a brief qualitative introduction of RADVOL-QC algorithm, the work describes the generation of several weather radar products - PPI, ETOP, VIL - based on QI. Then, the authors move to convection product based on the previous ones. The, in Section 6 the authors show an actual application of the algorithm to Ramza radar data. The work is scientifically weak and almost poorly described. The introduction is poor and some relevant works are missing (Zhang et al 2004, Norman et al. 2010). Above all, there is not objective evidence that QI based products are better than traditional ones: there is not a quantitative analysis that clearly demonstrates the benefits of this new algorithm. It is not clear how equation (1) is derived (theoretical basis) and how the empirical coefficients are obtained. The data corrections are obscure and it is not

completely described. Finally, the case study presented is poorly described, no information about radar site, weather conditions are available. There are not independent observations that validate the algorithm.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., 7, 11711, 2014.