

Interactive comment on “Measurement of wind profiles by motion-stabilised ship-borne Doppler lidar” by P. Achtert et al.

C.R. Wood (Referee)

curtis.wood@fmi.fi

Received and published: 15 October 2015

Summary:

* This is a positive contribution to the fields of doppler lidar and ABL research. This paper will certainly move the field forward.

* Excellent quality figures.

* A very interesting work.

* Language is almost flawless.

* It is a fairly rare pleasure to review work of high quality.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Specifics:

(1) I have made comments at specific places in the text in my uploaded .tex file, so it is very clear to you the places where I am suggesting manuscript edits.

(2) The biggest criticism that I have is with over-extensive use of correlation coefficient (coefficient of determination R^2). It is not appropriate in almost all scientific analysis. Much more useful if rmse, bias, etc. I have given suggested reading material in the .tex file. But if that R^2 issue is resolved, I expect to recommend this work to be published.

(3) In general many aspects of this work are not described well enough that they could be repeated by others. So please add much more about experimental setups.

(4) I think one case-study figure is needed, e.g. of a wind speed and direction profile time series for a day. It is hard for readers to fully interpret based on statistical summaries alone.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.atmos-meas-tech-discuss.net/8/C3281/2015/amtd-8-C3281-2015-supplement.zip>

Interactive comment on Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., 8, 9339, 2015.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

