Interactive comment on "PHIPS-HALO: The airborne Particle Habit Imaging and Polar Scattering probe. Part I: Design and Operation" *by* Ahmed Abdelmonem et al.

c. gurganus (Referee)

colin@specinc.com

This article describes a unique new instrument that may be of significant interest to the atmospheric science community. The fundamental operation of this instrument is unchanged from the proven PHIPS instrument described in great detail in Abdelmonem et al. 2011, so I have little doubt that the design is sound. I believe that Section 5 should be strengthened with the addition of significantly more laboratory data to verify the operation of the new instrument.

I have included a detailed summary of my comments in the attached PDF file.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

http://www.atmos-meas-tech-discuss.net/amt-2016-42/amt-2016-42-RC2-supplement.pdf