

December 10<sup>th</sup>, 2017

**Review for:** Atmospheric Measurement Techniques

**Manuscript number:** AMT 2017-254

**Title:** *A simple biota removal algorithm for 35-GHz cloud radar measurements.*

**Authors:** Madhu Chandra R. Kalapureddy, Sukanya Patra, Subrata K Das, Sachin M Deshpande, Kaustav Chakravarty<sup>1</sup>, Ambuj K Jha<sup>1</sup>, Prasad Kalekar, Hari Krishna Devisetty, Andrew L Pazamany and Pandithurai Govindan.

**Report on the revised manuscript and recommendation for disposition of the paper**

Author's responses to the questions I raised in the previous review are satisfactory. They followed quite closely my comments. they have made a real effort to improve the clarity and the technical and scientific content of the text following the comments of the different referees. New or corrected figures are added and new analyses or developments and explanations are presented and discussed. The arguments given in response to the referees criticisms are on the whole convincing. The main reproach which concerns the ability of the presented algorithm to work in all situation is certainly justified but the same comment can be made for previous more sophisticated equivalent techniques. Comparison with polarization measurements provides results from which future readers can form an opinion on the efficiency of the technique.

Better and simpler technique for discrimination between insects echoes and pure atmospheric echoes will be useful for both meteorologists and entomologists but indeed with opposite interest. The use of radar by entomologists to investigate insect behavior in the atmosphere is a growing research field. It is now well established that insect population is strongly decreasing. Observations made by entomologic radars might help to understand this dramatic evolution. It is one of the reasons to encourage scientific groups involved in radar data analysis. I consider that the paper under review is an honest work and as a consequence I recommend the publication of the revised manuscript in Atmospheric Measurement Techniques Journal.