

Interactive comment on “Effect of charges carried by atmospheric particles on radar power ratio” by Li Xie et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 2 February 2018

The scientific ideas of the submitted paper present a somewhat relevant to the purposes of the AMT journal. Furthermore, the concept of computationally quantifying the effects of charged particles on radar signal is to a certain extent plausible. I find that there is a lack of adequate presentation of previous work on the subject, although there is a number of references within the text. Probably, the author should reconsider the representativeness of the referencing material. Lastly, conducted calculations should be more complete and stated clearly within the text in order to allow their reproduction by fellow scientists.

As far as the overall presentation is concerned, a revision from an English native speaker is strongly advised again, since language misuse does not reflect the required standards for AMT. Also, the discussed results should be presented in a more concise

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



way and be validated with appropriate observations and expanded for various size distributions, not only the standard ones.

AMTD

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.atmos-meas-tech-discuss.net/amt-2017-384/amt-2017-384-RC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive
comment

Interactive comment on *Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss.*, doi:10.5194/amt-2017-384, 2017.

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)

