

## ***Interactive comment on “X-band dual-polarization radar-based hydrometeor classification for Brazilian tropical precipitation systems” by Jean-François Ribaud et al.***

### **Anonymous Referee #2**

Received and published: 30 November 2018

This is my second review of this manuscript. Overall, the authors have addressed the previous comments to the reviewer’s satisfaction. However, looks like some of the responses are not really well integrated in the main manuscript. The authors should revise the manuscript thoroughly according to their own responses.

For example, the authors have rephrased the description of using the melting layer as a parameter to detect liquid-ice delineation (lines 146-147 in the revised submission). But the content after this has not been revised accordingly (lines 147-151), which is still misleading.

The response about calibration of ZDR should be included in the main text as well.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



In addition, the authors stated that the attenuation correction would not significantly change the results, which is very subjective. The authors referred to Dolan and Rutledge (2009) regarding this point. But Dolan and Rutledge (2009) was devised from a very different aspect (i.e., scattering simulation and fuzzy logic application, no clustering).

Extra and careful attention should be paid to all these points. Other than these, I think this manuscript is ready for publication.

---

[Interactive comment on Atmos. Meas. Tech. Discuss., doi:10.5194/amt-2018-174, 2018.](#)

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)

