Dr John Reagan

This is a most comprehwensive, well written paper that carefully assesses the data and enumerates limitations of various assumptions made in the data assessment. It presents the best assessment/prediction to date of retrieved aerosol lidar ratios and AODs obtained from CALIPSO observations, made possible using the independent CALIPSO-SODA lidar ratio retrievals for comparison. Uncertainties in the CALIPSO Version 4.2 and the CALIPSO-SODA retrievals, and biases they contribute, are carefully considered. Discussions about agreements/disagreements in the comparison results are well reasoned and extensive.

R: We appreciate Dr Reagan's kind words. His recognition of our work is greatly appreciated.