

Evaluation of overall quality

The authors have clearly made good use of the time offered to revise this manuscript to thoughtfully address all my concerns following the initial review. The expansion of the CALIPSO dataset from 6 to 15 years, the inclusion of a much more expansive seasonal analysis, and additional effort to compare CATS and CALIPSO data for the same 2015-2017 time period build upon an already relevant manuscript and enhance its applicability to its target audience: long-term ground sites and shorter term field campaigns. Additionally, the authors took great pains to address the grammatical, consistency, and legibility issues that plagues the original manuscript. The revised manuscript as presented provides a complete and thorough study that is of interest to not only myself, but also toward those to whom their study is aimed and AMT's readers. Therefore, I recommend this revised manuscript for publication in AMT.

Specific Comments/Questions

Major:

- 1) None.

Minor:

- 1) None.

Technical Corrections

General comments:

- 1) I found several instances where the first line of a new paragraph was not indented (noted below), please briefly recheck the manuscript for these typos.
- 2) As compared to my first review, the authors have clearly gone through great lengths to address my grammatical, spelling, legibility, and consistency concerns from the first review. This second manuscript was much easier to read and digest and I greatly appreciate their efforts. Thank you!

Specific comments:

- 1) Page 1, line 15: grammar error, please indent new paragraph.
- 2) Page 3, line 56: grammar error, please indent new paragraph.
- 3) Page 3, line 76: grammar error, please indent new paragraph.
- 4) Page 4, line 97: grammar error, please indent new paragraph.
- 5) Page 5, line 120: grammar error, please indent new paragraph.
- 6) Page 6, line 180: grammar error, please indent new paragraph.
- 7) Page 7, line 214: grammar error, please indent new paragraph.
- 8) Page 9, line 258: grammar error, please indent new paragraph.
- 9) Page 9, line 265: grammar error, please indent new paragraph.