

To Reviewer:

We appreciate Reviewer's constructive comments.

Public justification (visible to the public if the article is accepted and published):

Thank you for your revised version of the paper. The figures are better but still need work to bring them to publication quality (see also Reviewer 1's second report) - this currently detracts from the paper. I'm not sure how you are producing these figures, but if your graphics program has the capability to output vector graphics (EPS or PDF) then please use this as it will avoid pixelation. Specific changes required:

1. Figure 1: Please remove the purple line: it makes the interpretation of the colour of the other line unclear, and adds no information to the figure since it is always next to the other line.

→ We removed the purple line.

2. Please add units to all figures where requested by Reviewer 1.

→ We added units in the captions of all figures.

3. Table 1: "clutter" and "noise" are uncountable nouns in this context, so should be singular not plural.

→ We modified "clutter" and "noise" based on your comment.

4. Figure 3: The border of the panels is not fully visible: try printing with vector graphics. Titles of panels, if they are really needed, should not contain underscores or redundant information. If you must have panel titles then "CPR reflectivity (dBZ)" and "CPR Doppler velocity (m/s)" would be more appropriate. Finally, can you use a more appropriate aspect

ratio for panels b and c? The information is very squashed with these square panels. At least set the x range of the panel to cover only the range of the data, to avoid whitespace on the left and right.

→ We removed the titles of panels and made more clear borders.

5. Figure 5: Border of panels not fully visible. What does "dBZ_CON" mean? Please use meaningful panel titles if you must have panel titles.

→ We removed the titles of panels and made more clear borders.

6. Figures 6 and 7: Please use clear panel titles: no underscores, no unnecessary abbreviations, no redundant information that is common to all panels (don't say this Frame A because they all are). Fig. 7: Set the x range to cover only the range of the data to avoid whitespace on left and right.

→ We removed the titles of panels and the changed the x range.

7. Figures 7 and 8: You say these are log scales but are you plotting the natural logarithm or the base-10 logarithm? Please state in the captions.

→ We added "a base-10" in the captions in Figs. 7 and 8.

8. Figure 8: Panel border not fully visible. Panel titles not really needed as the information is in the caption and the difference is obvious. (Also note that "backscatter" and "noise" are both uncountable nouns in this context so should be singular.)

→ We removed the titles of panels and made more clear borders.

9. Figure 10: It looks like this has been stored as a JPEG with lossy compression: the text is blurred. Please save as a vector format with clean text.

→ We convert the figure as a vector format (emf).

10. Figure 11: Fix panel titles. Caption: "lie" -> "line".

→ We removed the panel titles and modified the caption.

11. Figure 13c,d: Fix titles to panels, change x scale to fit to data avoiding whitespace.

→ We removed the titles of panels and the changed the x range.

12. Data availability statement should probably reference the DOI like this "<https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7835229> (Roh et al. 2023)" and then add the reference in the references section (similar to how it is listed on the Zenodo page).

→ We modified the statement in Data availability and add the reference based on your comment.

13. I suggest you use "SMILE" in capitals throughout: at first use it is apparently an acronym.

→ We changed "SMILE" from "smile".

Woosub Roh

Atmosphere and Ocean Research Institute, The University of Tokyo

5-1-5, Kashiwanoha, Kashiwa-shi, Chiba, Japan

Phone No: 81- 04-7136-4371

Fax No: 81- 04-7136-4375

Email Address: ws-roh@ori.u-tokyo.ac.jp