

Summary

The manuscript presents a Hybrid Ship Clutter Identification (HSCI) algorithm that combines a random-forest classifier on six polarimetric/Doppler features with an adaptive sidelobe-masking scheme. While the authors have thoroughly resolved all minor issues and clarified methodological details, five core concerns remain only partially addressed, namely generalization to other waveforms/environments, annotation bias, quantitative precipitation-loss metrics, independent test datasets, and explicit code availability.

- **Rigorous Validation Metrics:** The authors have now added precision, recall, and F1-score metrics (all >97 %) in Section 4.2 and updated the abstract to include them, fully satisfying the request for rigorous performance reporting.
- **Generality Across Waveforms and Environments:** In Section 5 the authors acknowledge that this is a pilot study and explicitly discuss the limitation to LFM, 0.5° scans, but they have not provided any new empirical tests on NLFM waveforms, different elevation angles, or varied sea conditions. They must either include at least one additional validation case (e.g., an NLFM scan or a different elevation/season) or explicitly narrow all claims to the current test setup.
- **Manual Labeling Bias:** The authors clarified that a single annotator (the first author) labeled all gates with continuity checks, improving transparency in Section 2, but they still provide no inter-annotator agreement statistics. To address potential subjectivity, they should perform a simple second-annotator check on a representative subset or, at minimum, discuss in more depth how annotation bias might affect results.
- **Quantitative Assessment of Precipitation-Loss:** The manuscript now shows qualitative rain-field improvements in mixed scenes (Fig. 13b), but it lacks any numeric metric on how many precipitation gates are inadvertently removed. The authors need to report concise quantitative statistics (for example, the percentage of precipitation gates masked) for at least one mixed-scene case.
- **Independent Test Dataset:** The authors document using 5-fold GridSearchCV in Section 3.1.3, but they did not reserve any fully independent radar volume or day as a hold-out test. They should, if feasible, reserve one full sweep or day for independent validation and report its performance.